

DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 298 360

CG 021 040

AUTHOR Rafaeli, Anat
TITLE When Clerks Meet Customers: A Test of Variables
 Related to Emotional Expressions on the Job.
PUB DATE Apr 88
NOTE 31p.; Revision of a paper presented at the Annual
 Convention of the American Psychological Association
 (95th, New York, NY, August 28-September 1, 1987).
PUB TYPE Reports - Research/Technical (143) --
 Speeches/Conference Papers (150)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC02 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *Affective Behavior; *Dress Codes; Foreign Countries;
 *Interpersonal Relationship; *Prosocial Behavior;
 *Sales Workers; *Sex Differences; Work Environment
IDENTIFIERS Israel; *Uniforms

ABSTRACT

Although many modern occupations require employees to express particular types of emotions while doing their jobs, little empirical evidence exists about factors related to emotional behavior on the job. This study investigated the relationship between emotional displays (smiling, greeting, thanking, eye contact) of sales clerks and variables of clerk attributes, clerk behaviors, customer attributes, and contextual factors. Specifically, the relationships between clerk gender, customer gender, the wearing of a uniform, and the display of positive emotions were examined. The behavior of 1,319 sales clerks during their interactions with customers was observed and coded. Female clerks were observed displaying positive emotions significantly more frequently than were male clerks. Male clients, however, were found to receive more positive emotional expressions than female clients. Employees were more likely to display positive emotions when wearing an organizational smock and a name tag. A lower level of positive emotional display was observed when a long line of customers was waiting or when a coworker was present. No relationship was observed between time of day and the display of positive emotion. The findings suggest that sex role socialization may generalize to behavior at work, especially the tendency of women to display a greater frequency of positive emotions, and the inclination of individuals of both sexes to attribute higher status to men. The findings also suggest that wearing organizational identifiers may be related to an increase in employees' self-awareness and may therefore be worthy of further organizational research. (Author/NB)

* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *

ED 298360

When Clerks Meet Customers:

A Test of Variables Related to Emotional Expressions on the Job

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION
CENTER (ERIC)

- ☒ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.
- ☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.
- ☐ Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

Anat Rafaeli

School of Business Administration
Hebrew University of Jerusalem
Mt. Scopus, Jerusalem, 91905
Israel

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS
MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Anat Rafaeli

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES
INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

CG 021040

Running Head: Emotional Expressions on the Job

April, 1988

Portions of this study were conducted while the author was visiting at the Department of Industrial Engineering and Engineering Management at Stanford University. This article was supported by the Recanati Fund of the School of Business at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. An earlier version of this paper was presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Psychological Association, New York, 1987.

I would like to thank David Berg, Gary Bornstein, Yaccov Schul and Bob Sutton for their help and comments on earlier versions of the paper. I would also like to thank three anonymous reviewers for their extensive and helpful comments.

Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Anat Rafaeli, School of Business Administration, Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Jerusalem, Israel 91905.

Abstract

This study examines the relationship between "emotional behavior" (smiling, greeting, thanking, eye contact) and variables from four categories (clerk attributes, clerk behaviors, customer attributes, and contextual factors). Specifically, the relationships between clerk sex, customer sex, the wearing of a uniform, and the display of positive emotions are examined.

The behavior of 1,319 sales clerks during their interaction with customers was observed and coded. As predicted, female clerks were observed displaying positive emotions significantly more frequently than male clerks. Male clients, however, were found to receive more positive emotional expressions than female clients. Employees were more likely to display positive emotions when wearing an organizational smock and a name tag, but a lower level of positive emotional display was observed when a long line of customers was waiting or when a co-worker was present. No relationship was observed between time of day and the display of positive emotion. The findings suggest that sex role socialization may generalize to behavior at work, especially the tendency of women to display a greater frequency of positive emotions, and the inclination of individuals of both sexes to attribute higher status to men. The findings also suggest that wearing organizational identifiers (uniform, name tag) may be related to an increase in employees' self awareness and may therefore be worthy of further organizational research.

Introduction

Many modern occupations require incumbents to express particular types of emotions as part of doing the job (Rafaeli & Sutton, 1987). Hochschild (1983), for example, reports that flight attendants are expected to act friendly and cheerful on the job while bill collectors are expected to convey anger. Similarly, Arther and Caputo (1959) describe how police interrogators use hostility to gain confessions from criminals, and Bell (1984) reports that fellow physicians placed severe pressure on her to hide certain feelings, notably sadness.

Emotional expression is central to roles that entail serving others (Czepiel, Solomon, & Suprenant, 1985). Grocery clerks, bank tellers, and fast food servers are usually instructed to act friendly toward customers. This is because courtesy appears to play an important role in formulating clerk and customer perceptions of service quality (Schneider & Bowen, 1985; Schneider, Parkington & Buxton, 1980). Indeed, an emerging body of research on the "service encounter" (cf. Czepiel et al., 1985) emphasizes the importance of careful attention to the emotional behavior of service employees, as a part of the broader construct of climate for service.

In order to establish and maintain the desired organizational facade, service organizations often employ selection and socialization practices that focus on displayed emotions; to illustrate, only "jolly" people are accepted for Santa Claus training (San Francisco Chronicle, November 15, 1984, p.3). Moreover, formal (Ash, 1984; Komaki, Blood, & Holder, 1980; Walt Disney Productions, 1982), as well as informal socialization practices (Bell, 1984; Van Maanen, 1973) teach employees organizational norms about emotional expression on the job. Hochschild (1983) labeled such norms "organizational feeling rules".

Nonetheless, little empirical evidence is available about factors related

to emotional behavior on the job. The present study attempts to enhance our understanding of this topic by testing hypotheses about the relationship between various variables and emotional displays of sales clerks. Due to the paucity of previous research, variables from four categories were included in the study as potential correlates of displayed emotions. These categories were: clerk attributes, clerk behaviors, customer attributes, and attributes of the context in which clerks and customers meet.

Clerk Attributes: Sex Role Socialization and Conveyed Emotions

The first part of the study examined clerk sex, and its relationship to the emotions conveyed on the job. Gender differences in non-verbal behavior are well-documented (Deaux, 1985). It is commonly argued that men tend to display non-verbal cues that reflect power and authority, while women typically display more warmth and liking cues (Bem, 1974; Frieze & Ramsey, 1976; Siegler & Siegler, 1976). A similar pattern of differences is also evident when verbal behavior is observed (Putnam & McCallister, 1980).

It is unclear, however, to what extent the results of previous studies on gender differences can be generalized to emotional behavior on the job. Previous research has described behavior in social settings. In contrast, the present study focuses on settings in which "feeling rules" emerge as part of an organizational or occupational socialization process. Thus, a first question of the present study is whether gender differences -- which have been documented in other settings -- will be evident in the emotions conveyed when service employees interact with customers.

If gender differences due to sex role socialization transfer to behavior on the job, then female employees can be expected to display more warmth and friendliness cues than male employees. In contrast, managerial literature recommends the display of positive and esteem enhancing emotion by all service

employees (Ash, 1984; Peters & Austin, 1985). Thus, organizational feeling rules endeavor to suppress gender differences in emotional expressions. When organizational feeling rules are followed, female and male employees can be expected to smile and greet all customers to a similar extent.

Local feeling rules, however, may not overcome gender-linked differences in emotional expression. Sex role socialization is a life long process, supported by myriad sources including child rearing policies, parental masculinity and femininity, and other parental attributes and behaviors (Bem, 1974; Looft, 1973; Spence & Helmreich, 1978). In contrast, organizational socialization involves fewer sources of influence, and pertains to a narrower domain of behaviors. Thus, it is expected that gender differences will be evident in emotional behavior on the job.

Hypothesis 1: Female service employees are more likely to display warmth and friendliness cues on the job than male service employees.

Clerk Behavior: Wearing an Organizational Uniform and Emotional Expression

A second category of factors that are likely to be related to emotional expressions on the job comprises other behaviors that an employee exhibits. In particular, since conveying organizationally prescribed emotions is an act of compliance with organizational feeling rules (Hochschild, 1983), employee behaviors reflecting compliance seem like a promising start.

One indicator of compliance is the wearing of organizational symbols. The wearing of a name tag, for example, is often required in service organizations; this behavior may be perceived (by management and/or employees) as a cue to the employee that he or she has "walked into" and "put on" his or her work role. When wearing a smock or a name tag, an individual is clearly identified as a member of the organization, and can also be expected to adopt

local norms of behavior. In short, the wearing of a smock and a name tag may encourage employees to compare their behavior to local (organizational) standards of behavior (Wicklund & Fry, 1980; Carver & Scheier, 1981).

The wearing of a uniform may also reflect an employee's job satisfaction; wearing organizational identification may be an indicator that the employee is proud and content with the job. Such satisfaction with the job and the organization could spill over to cheerfulness, and to positive emotional display on the job. Thus, among satisfied employees a greater frequency of positive emotional display, along with a greater frequency of uniform wearing, is not unlikely. In short, there are at least two reasons why uniform wearing can be expected to be related to display of positive emotion. First, the uniform may enhance a comparison of the self to local (organizational) norms of behavior. Second, the uniform may reflect a generally positive attitude toward the organization.

Hypothesis 2: Employees wearing an organizational uniform are more likely to display positive emotions than their peers who are not wearing a uniform.

Wearing a uniform may also be related to the extent to which gender differences are evident in the emotional behavior on the job. An extension of the "walking into the role" metaphor is that upon adopting their work role, employees shed other roles. While comparing their behavior to local standards of behavior, employees may let go of alternative scripts of behavior, including those that have been structured by gender-linked socialization (Mandler, 1984). If this is true, gender differences are more likely to be evident among clerks who are not wearing a uniform than among their peers who are dressed according to the organizational code. This is the rationale for a third hypothesis:

Hypothesis 3: Sex differences in emotional expressions will be stronger among clerks who are not wearing a uniform

than among their peers who are wearing it.

It is interesting to note that the third hypothesis is, in a way, a competitive test of the two reasons offered for the second hypothesis. Hypothesis 3 is consistent with the "local comparison" rationale. If the uniform reminds clerks to compare their behavior to the local standards then sex differences should be less apparent among clerks who are wearing a uniform. In contrast, if job satisfaction is an exogenous variable responsible for both the wearing of a uniform and the display of good cheer then wearing a uniform is not likely to suppress gender differences. Obviously, however, only very clear results in support of the third hypothesis could shed light on these two competing explanations.

Attributes of the Customer: Social Behavior Generalized to Job Behavior

A third category of variables that may shape the emotional cues conveyed by a clerk includes attributes of the customer -- the partner to the service interaction. Hester, Koger, & McCauley (1985), for example, found that the social - emotional behavior of the customer was the best predictor of clerk sociability. Along similar lines, Goodsell (1976) found customer appearance to affect postal clerks' behavior. Since clerk-customer encounters are "first and foremost social encounters" (McCallum & Harrison, 1985, p.35), customer sex may be related to the clerks' emotional expressions.

Informal norms of social behavior include particularly warm and friendly expressions when encountering a person of the opposite sex, perhaps due to socialization for courting behavior. If such norms influence behavior during work-related encounters, clerks of either sex are likely to act more friendly toward clients of the opposite sex than toward customers of their own sex.

When an employee represents the organization, however, he or she should convey warmth to all customers, regardless of their gender. Thus, if

organizational expectations govern employees' behavior, all employees should act friendly toward all customers. It is reasonable to assume, however, that socialization toward behavior in social encounters is a longer and more powerful process than organizational socialization, and is likely to penetrate behavior on the job in spite of organizational feeling rules. Hence a fourth hypothesis:

Hypothesis 4: Male and female clerks will display more positive emotional expressions toward customers of the opposite sex than toward customers of their own sex.

Attributes of the Context in Which a Transaction Occurs

The extent of compliance with organizational feeling rules may also be affected by various attributes of the context in which the interaction with a customer takes place. Three attributes of the context were selected for the present study: the presence of other customers, the presence of other employees, and the timing of the interaction.

Presence of Other Customers

Isenberg (1981) found that people under time pressure expect themselves to be more task oriented, and less friendly than people working at their leisure. Moreover, the knowledge that other people are waiting for the clerk may create stress that hampers a clerk's ability to act friendly. Clerks in this study were also aware, however, that "mystery shoppers" -- (monitoring representatives of the parent organization) -- may be among the customers waiting in their line. Moreover, the presence of customers may enhance clerks awareness of their organizational role, and encourage compliance with organizational norms of behavior. Thus, there are conflicting hypotheses about the relationship between the presence of other customers and the display of good cheer.

Presence of Other Employees

Contradictory hypotheses can also be generated about the relationship between the presence of a co-worker and the display of positive emotion. Co-workers may be a source of pressure for conformity to local norms. In contrast, co-workers may be a source of social entertainment in the sense that, when co-workers are present employees may prefer to focus their social skills on these co-workers, rather than on customers. Thus, the presence of co-workers may be related to lower, or to higher, levels of displayed positive emotions.

Timing of an Interaction

The dynamics of the third contextual factor -- timing of an interaction - are also unclear. During the day, management monitoring and control are often tighter. Thus, more compliance with organizational feeling rules may be expected. Furthermore, the loneliness and danger of crime associated with night work may arouse anxiety (Melbin, 1978), and may impair employees' ability to act friendly toward customers. Conversely, the influx of customer demands during day shifts often entails stress, stress that might hamper employees' compliance with organizational feeling rules. Night work may be more relaxed (Melbin, 1978), and might allow more room for pleasant social interaction between clerks and customers.

In short, there are competing hypotheses about the relationship between the various contextual factors and displayed emotions. Because of this ambiguity no preliminary hypotheses were set here, and the relationship between contextual factors and emotional expression was examined in an exploratory mode.

Method

Sample and Overview

The data were collected as part of an evaluation of employee courtesy by

a large chain of grocery stores. Corporate executives were interested to know the level of courtesy in the organization. The evaluation project was therefore designed and implemented by the research staff of the corporation.

Corporate rules in the organization require positive emotional display, as well as smock and tag wearing, from all employees. One-day training sessions, which are compulsory for all new hires, include segments about these behaviors, in addition to technical issues such as pricing, stocking, and register operation. A training program for store managers also includes discussions about the importance of positive emotional display, and wearing of smocks and tags for maintaining the store image. Thus, these behaviors constitute strong norms endorsed by the parent organization, but no real sanctions exist against employees who violate them.

The sample comprised 11,716 clerk-customer transactions involving 1,319 clerks, who are employed in 576 small, neighborhood stores. The stores sell groceries and small convenience items, and operate around the clock. All stores were visited twice: once during the morning shift and once during the swing shift. Twenty-five percent of the stores (144 stores, 577 clerks) were observed a third time during the night shift.

Procedure

In preparation for the data collection, observers made repeated visits to a sample of pre-test stores. They watched and coded clerk behaviors and compared observations after each visit. Any differences in coding were discussed and clarified. This pre-test was continued until a satisfactory level of inter-observer reliability was confirmed. The data from the pre-test were not included in the final analyses.

Store managers were notified that "mystery shoppers" might be visiting their stores during the spring or summer of 1985 to observe employee courtesy.

No specific information was given about the timing of the visit or the exact information sought. Observers visited each store acting as regular customers. (Marketing information identified the latter as working class, 18 to 34 year-old males; observers were selected and instructed to dress accordingly.) Observers were "incognito participant observers" (Webb, Campbell, Schwartz, Sechrest, & Grove, 1981), since they acted like typical customers.

All observations were noted on pre-formatted 3" x 5" cards. Only one clerk was observed during each visit, even if more than one register was operating. Observers walked around for a few minutes as if looking for what to buy; they noted the clerk's sex and whether he or she was wearing a smock and a name tag. They also noted the presence of employees other than the clerk observed. Typically, the observers then walked to the magazine rack since it is usually close to the cash registers. Clerk behaviors toward customers, customer gender and attributes of the context were usually coded from this vantage point. The observers then selected a small item, such as a bag of peanuts, and stood in line. While standing in line they continued to note employee behaviors toward other customers. Observers left the store after paying for their purchase.

The amount of time in each store varied from 4 to 12 minutes. This time could not be predetermined because observers were instructed to stay in each store as long as possible (in order to code the largest number of transactions possible). Yet, if there were only a few customers around, the visit was kept short; otherwise the clerk was likely to become suspicious. In order to eliminate a possible experimental effect, observers indicated when they thought that the clerk became suspicious. Observations coded suspicious, (less than 3%), were excluded from the analyses.

Subject Informed Consent

New employees of all stores are informed, in the course of corporate

training, that their behavior toward customers is an important component of the job, and that it may be observed and recorded by mystery shoppers. Thus, while specific informed consent was not obtained from each subject, the employees understood that encounters with mystery shoppers are a condition of employment. The use of "incognito observers" does not pose an ethical problem here because the behaviors observed are clearly public and are a routine requirement in the employees' job. The names of individuals were not recorded, guaranteeing anonymity and confidentiality of the data (see Salancik, 1979, and Webb, et al., 1981 for a discussion of related ethical issues).

Dependent Variable

Clerk Emotional Behavior

Quality emotional work by sales clerks entails displaying a warm and friendly facade so that customers feel good about the encounter. This can be done through verbal or non-verbal channels. Accordingly, the measure of the clerk's emotional behavior comprised 2 verbal behaviors (greeting, thanking) and two non-verbal behaviors (smiling, eye contact):

a. Greeting: Whether clerk greeted customers. Only a "Hello", "How are you today?" or something to that effect was considered a greeting. A mere "Is that all for you?" was not coded as a greeting;

b. Thanking: Whether clerk actually thanked the customer after the transaction. The word "Thank" or its derivative had to be used for a positive coding on this variable;

c. Smiling: Whether clerk smiled at customers. Following Tidd and Lockard (1978), a smile was considered a noticeable upturn of the lips;

d. Eye contact: Whether clerk attempted to establish eye contact. A direct gaze by the clerk was considered an honest attempt at establishing eye contact, regardless of the customers' reciprocation.

These behaviors were coded at the transaction level of analysis: The behavior of each clerk during each transaction was coded. A value of "1" was given for each behavior (smiling greeting, etc.) that was displayed, a value of "0" if it was not displayed. Four summary variables were then generated from these data. First, the four values observed for the same transaction were combined into an index of "Transaction emotional display" by computing their mathematical mean (Cronbach's Alpha = .74). Second, an index of "Clerk emotional display" was created by averaging the ratings of all the transactions observed for the same clerk (Cronbach's Alpha = .92). Third, an index of "Emotional display to male customers" (Cronbach's Alpha = .89) and an index of "Emotional display to female customers" (Cronbach's Alpha = .82) were created for each clerk.

Independent Variables

1. Clerk sex: Observers assigned a value of 0 if the clerk was male, 1 if the clerk was female. 56% of the observed clerks were female.
2. Customer sex: A similar code was used to note the gender of the customer in each transaction. 20% of the customers were female.
3. Wearing the organizational uniform: This variable included two components: wearing a smock and wearing a name tag. A value of 0 was assigned if neither was worn, 1 if only a smock or a name tag was worn, and 2 if both name tag and smock were worn.
4. Timing of Interaction: Observers noted the time of day during which the observation had begun. Following Zedeck, Jackson, and Summers (1983), as well as conventions of the organization, this variable was recoded into a "day" shift value (7:00 a.m. to 3:00 p.m.), "swing" shift (3:00 p.m. to 11:00 p.m.), and "night" shift (11:00 p.m. to 7:00 a.m.).
5. Line Length: Observers recorded the number of customers waiting in

line during each transaction. This variable was recoded into three categories: short line (0-2 customers), moderate line (3 customers), long line (4 or more customers).

6. Presence of Other Employees: A value of 1 was assigned if any other employees were present next to the observed clerk, a value of 0 if none were present.

Results

Means, standard deviations, and intercorrelations of study variables are presented in Table 1. It should be noted that, since each clerk was observed during interactions with more than one customer, the statistics about customer sex are based on an $n = 11,716$.

Insert Table 1 about here

Analyses of variance were used to test the hypotheses; the results are summarized in Table 2. All analyses were conducted at the clerk level of analysis, with clerk display of positive emotion as the dependent variable. Five separate analyses were conducted. First the main effect of clerk sex was tested in a one way ANOVA (Hypothesis 1). A second model included "wearing the uniform," clerk sex, and their interaction. The main effects in this model offered a test of the second hypothesis; the interaction term was a test of the third hypothesis. The fourth hypothesis was tested with a two way analysis of variance (clerk sex and customer sex as main effects); emotions displayed to males and emotions displayed to females were two values of a repeated factor (customer sex) in this analysis. In a fifth analysis the main effects of the three contextual variables were examined.

Insert Table 2 about here

Sex of Clerk and Emotional Expression

As can be seen in Table 2, the main effect of clerk sex was significant, supporting the first hypothesis ($F = 38.44$, $p < .001$). The cell means presented at the bottom of Table 3 confirm that the mean display of positive emotions was higher among female clerks than among male clerks, as predicted.

Insert Table 3 about here

The observed sex differences may suggest to some readers that sex can be used to select employees for positions such as the ones observed here. It is therefore important to note that both male and female clerks were observed to display the complete range of displayed emotions. (The range for both groups is between 0.00 and 1.00.) Moreover, the standard deviation of both groups was similar (female $SD = .280$; male $SD = .272$). Thus, any one male or female clerk may display any value of positive emotion; females, however, are likely to display higher values of this variable.

Wearing the Organizational Uniform and Emotional Expression

The relationship between wearing the organizational uniform and the display of positive emotions was also significant, as suggested by the second hypothesis ($F = 14.96$, $p < .001$). Clerks wearing smocks and name tags were more likely to act according to organizational feeling rules than clerks who were not wearing these corporate symbols. Scheffe's post-hoc analysis confirmed ($p < .05$) that the three levels of uniform-wearing were significantly different from one another for the total sample, and were in the order suggested by the second hypothesis.

The third hypothesis was also confirmed. The interaction predicted between clerk sex and wearing a uniform was significant ($F = 2.45$, $p < .01$);

Scheffe's ($p < .05$) comparison of means revealed a somewhat unexpected pattern, however. At all levels of uniform wearing, males displayed significantly lower values than females. But the difference between the male and female distribution was greatest among clerks wearing either a smock or a name tag ($D=.11$ as compared to $D=.05$ and $D=.06$). Indeed, the difference between males and females not wearing any symbol was not significantly different from the difference between males and females wearing both symbols.

Among male clerks the level of emotional display was highest ($M = .43$) when the clerk was wearing both a smock and a name tag. The other two levels of uniform-wearing (neither corporate symbol; smock or tag) were not significantly different from each other in the sample of male clerks ($M = .34$ and $M = .35$, $p > .05$). In contrast, among female clerks, wearing no corporate symbol was associated with the lowest level of display of positive emotion ($M = .40$); but the mean level of positive emotional display among women was not different when only one identifier or both identifiers were worn ($M = .46$ and $M = .48$, $p > .05$).

Thus, although the third hypothesis had predicted greater sex differences among clerks not wearing any corporate symbol, the results indicated that sex differences were greatest among clerks who were wearing at least one identifier (a smock or a name tag).

Sex of the Customer and Emotional Expressions

The fourth hypothesis predicted that clerks of either sex would display more positive emotional expressions toward customers of the opposite sex than toward customers of their own sex. As indicated above, in order to test this hypothesis two indices -- one of emotional behavior toward male customers and one of emotional behavior toward female customers -- were generated for each clerk. The analysis for the fourth hypothesis included these two variables as two values of a repeated factor.

As can be seen in Table 2, a significant relationship was found between customer sex and clerk emotional display ($F = 988.87, p < .001$). The clerk sex - customer sex interaction (which was predicted by the fourth hypothesis) was also significant, if one accepts the .10 level of significance ($F=3.34, p < .07$). Scheffe's Post-hoc analyses ($p < .05$) of the cell means reported in Table 3 indicated that the four cells in this analysis were significantly different from one another. The pattern of these relationships, however, was not exactly as predicted by the fourth hypothesis. Female clerks were observed to offer higher levels of positive emotional display to male customers than to female customers, as expected. Male clerks, however, also displayed more positive emotions to male clients, than to female clients.

Context of the Transaction and Emotional Expressions

The relationships between three attributes of the context of a transaction and an employee's display of positive emotions were examined: number of customers in line, presence of other employees, and timing of the interaction. A separate analysis was performed for each attribute.

The length of a line that a clerk faces bore a significant relationship to the display of positive emotions ($F = 26.54, p < .001$). Scheffe's post hoc comparison of means confirmed ($p < .05$) that the three levels of the line length variable were significantly different from one other. An observation of these means revealed that the average level of positive emotional display decreased as the length of the line of customers increased.

The presence of other employees also bore a significant relationship to the display of positive emotion ($F = 7.48, p < .01$). When other clerks were present the average level of displayed positive emotion was lower than when no other employees were present.

A third test examined the relationship between the time of day and

compliance with organizational feeling rules. Only 25% of the original sample of stores were visited during the night; therefore, a random sample of 25% of the day and swing shift observations was selected, yielding an n of 577 for the testing of this hypothesis. As can be seen in Table 2, the relationship between shift and emotional display was not significant.

Finally, as a measure of methodological control, the three contextual variables (line of customers, presence of other employees, and time of day) were introduced as covariates into the first four hypothesis-testing analyses. The introduction of these covariates did not affect the pattern of the observed relationships. That is, hypotheses 1,2,3 and 4 were still confirmed, and the results remained in the direction reported above.

Discussion

The present study offers some insight on the dynamics of emotional expression on the job. The results suggest that female sales clerks, and employees wearing uniforms (smocks and name tags), convey higher levels of positive emotions; the presence of other clerks, and a longer line of customers, appear to be associated with a lower magnitude of displayed emotions.

The exact reason for the observed sex differences is still unclear. Sex role socialization is probably at least partially responsible; women's socialization to act in a warm and friendly manner (Deaux, 1985; Frieze & Ramsey, 1976), as well as women's greater need for social approval (Hoffman, 1972), may encourage them to heed polite social amenities. Alternatively, however, women's display of positive emotion may reflect their increased tendency to conformity (cf. Wrightsman, 1977); in the context examined here, smiling, greeting, and maintaining eye contact are all acts of compliance with local feeling rules.

It could also be argued that the findings reflect women's improved ability at encoding their emotions (Hall & Halberstadt, 1981; Zuckerman, Lipets, Koivumaki, & Rosenthal, 1975). Both male and female clerks may be making honest attempts to display the "right" emotions; female clerks may simply be more successful. From an organizational standpoint, however, the causes of the observed sex differences are immaterial. The external display of emotions is useful for an organization if, and only if, these emotions are "gleaned by the observer" (Goffman, 1969), who in this case is the customer.

That only male observers were employed may be a threat to the validity of the observed sex differences. If men are particularly sensitive to emotional displays by women, the observers employed in the present study might have biased the results by noticing more of the emotions displayed by female clerks than those conveyed by male clerks.

The results with regard to customer sex were unexpected, yet important. Male customers were offered more positive emotions from both male and female clerks. This finding may reflect the generally higher status attributed to men (Millet, 1970). It may also reflect sex differences in courting behavior. Females may generalize their courting behaviors to instances (such as those observed here) where their jobs entail serving men. In contrast, serving a woman may bother some men, and therefore might not be perceived as an appropriate setting for courting. Clearly these are only speculations.

The positive relationship between the wearing of an organizational uniform and the display of organizationally-prescribed emotions is thought-provoking. Uniform-wearing is a prevalent norm in organizations; yet this variable hasn't been addressed in the organizational literature. The variable is clearly worthy of further research, especially because it offers an interesting opportunity to examine the implications of self awareness theory (Wicklund & Duval, 1971; Wicklund & Frey, 1980) for organizational behavior.

Self-awareness theory posits that under certain conditions (e.g., when sitting in front of a mirror or a camera) subjects tend to focus their attention on themselves and to examine their own behavior. This self-examination includes a focus on whichever dimension of the self is most salient, and a comparison of this dimension to a standard, or a frame of reference (Carver & Scheier, 1981; Duval & Wicklund, 1972; Wicklund & Frey, 1980).

When an individual is at work, a salient dimension of his or her self is likely to be the "organizational self", that is, his or her behavior as an employee. Thus, according to self-awareness theory, when employees' self-awareness is aroused, they are likely to focus on their behavior as employees and to compare this behavior to the standards set by the organization. Employees with increased self-awareness can therefore be expected to display greater compliance with organizational rules and regulations.

Wearing an organizational symbol -- a smock, a name tag, or a tie with an apple on it -- may increase employees' self-awareness in the same way that a camera or a mirror have been found to do so in the laboratory. Indeed, the positive relationship observed here between uniform wearing and emotional behavior offers support for such a hypothesis. The pattern of behavior stimulated by the self-directed focus depends, of course, on the norms that prevail in a specific setting. But it may well be that employees who wear a uniform take fewer breaks, or act more cautious, in the same way that uniform-wearing subjects in the present study were more friendly.

The relationship between organizational identifiers and the display of positive emotions was moderated by the sex of the clerk. Only one corporate symbol (a smock or a name tag) was necessary before a change in the emotional behavior of female clerks was evident. In contrast, a more major form of organizational identification (i.e., both smock and name tag) was necessary

before a change of similar magnitude was evident among male clerks.

This difference between men and women clerks may be due to the observed sex differences in emotional behavior. Since females' behavior is usually closer to the organizational norm, they may need less self-awareness (than males) to bring about their compliance. Other gender differences may also help explain the interaction between sex and organizational symbols. One possibility is that sex differences in self confidence and self esteem (Maccoby & Jacklin, 1974) are responsible for these findings since these variables are known to be related to the propensity for increased self-awareness (Duval & Wickland, 1972). Following the logic that company symbols serve as reminders to gauge one's behavior, it may be that (perhaps because of higher self confidence) males need a more comprehensive reminder (i.e., smock and tag), while a smaller reminder (i.e., smock or tag) is sufficient to make women compare their behavior to the local norms.

There are plausible rival explanations for the uniform main effect. Tighter managerial control, for example, may be responsible for the simultaneous higher values of both emotional display and smock and tag-wearing. The data analysis offers some reason to dispute this rival hypothesis, since the presence of another employee suggests some form of social control, and the introduction of this variable as a co-variate did not affect the significant relationship between emotional display and wearing a uniform. Nonetheless, only an experimental design, where smock and tag-wearing are manipulated and controlled, can completely refute this rival hypothesis.

It is also possible that wearing a uniform and the display of positive emotions both reflect the exogenous variable of job satisfaction. As mentioned earlier, satisfied employees may be proud to wear the organizational uniform and may also find it easier to comply with local "feeling rules." That sex differences were observed in the pattern of the relationship between

uniform wearing and emotional display makes this hypothesis somewhat less likely. The results with regard to the third hypothesis were not sufficiently clear, however, to completely rule out this explanation.

Considering an integration of job satisfaction with the set of variables examined in this study offers some new insights on the enigmatic relationship between job satisfaction and job performance. To illustrate, emotional behavior and uniform wearing may be components of what Organ and his colleagues labeled "good citizenship" behaviors, that is behaviors that reflect general compliance with organizational norms (Bateman & Organ, 1983; Organ, 1977; Smith, Organ and Near, 1983). Existing measures of organizational citizenship do not include emotion work, or uniform-wearing; however conceptually the concepts are clearly related since good citizenship does include pro-social gestures, and activities that help promote company image. Since positive links between job satisfaction and good citizenship have been documented (cf. Smith et al, 1983), future research should examine the relationship between the display of positive emotion, the wearing of a uniform, good citizenship, and job satisfaction.

Future research may also seek additional variables that can predict level of emotional display. In particular, employers will likely appreciate knowledge about predictors that can be legitimately used for personnel selection. Several clerk characteristics seem promising. To illustrate, extroversion (vs. introversion) may be helpful since extroverted clerks are probably more likely to act in a friendly and social manner toward their customers. Individual needs may also be related to the inclination to convey positive emotions. Puffer (1987), for example, reports that need for achievement is positively related to "pro-social" behaviors among commissioned salespeople. In a similar vein, high needs for affiliation may be related to emotional expression among other service employees, especially those who do not get paid according to their sales.

In closing, it should be noted, that the present study does not offer any information about the desirable levels of emotional display. This is a broad and complex issue calling for data from both organizations and clients. Sutton & Rafaeli (1987), for example, describe how the pace of a store determines the types of emotions that customers and clerks seek. Moreover, Rafaeli (1987) found meaningful variation in customers' expectations from supermarket cashiers.

Along similar lines, attributes of a sales clerk may govern clients in formulating their expectations. To illustrate, customers may expect less positive emotional displays from males than from females. Alternatively, customers may expect a particular pattern of behavior from service employees encountered at different times of day, or in different types of stores. All these are interesting questions for further research.

References

- Arther, R.O., and Caputo, R.R. 1959. Interrogation for investigators.
New York, N.Y.: William C. Copp and Associates.
- Ash, M.K. 1984. Mary Kay on people management, New York, Warner Books.
- Bateman, T.S. & Organ, D.W. 1983. "Job satisfaction and the good soldier:
The relationship between affect and employee "citizenship."
Academy of Management Journal, 26, 4, 587-595.
- Bell, M. 1984. Teachings of the heart, The Journal of American Medical
Association, 252, 2684.
- Bem, S.L. 1974. The measurement of psychological androgyny. Journal of
Consulting and Clinical Psychology, 42: 155-162.
- Carver, C.S. and Scheier, M.F., 1981 Attention and self regulation:
A control-theory approach to human behavior. New York:
Springer-Verlag.
- Czepiel, J.A., Solomon, M.R., & Surprenant, C.F. 1985. The service
encounter. Lexington, MA: Lexington Books.
- Deaux, K. 1985. Sex differences. Annual Review of Psychology, 36, 49-82.
- Duval, S. & Wicklund, R.A. 1972. A theory of objective self awareness.
New York: Academic Press.
- Freize, I.H., & Ramsey, S.J. 1976. Nonverbal maintenance of traditional
sex roles. Journal of Social Issues, 32 (3): 133-141.
- Goffman, E. 1969. Strategic interaction. Philadelphia: University of
Pennsylvania Press.
- Goodsell, C.T. 1976 Cross cultural comparisons of behavior of postal clerks
toward customers. Administrative Science Quarterly, 21, 140-150.
- Hall, J.A., & Halberstadt, A.G. 1981. Sex roles and nonverbal communication
skills. Sex Roles, 7(3): 273-287.

- Hester, L., Koger, P., & McCauley, C. 1985. Individual differences in customer sociability. European Journal of Social Psychology, 15, 453-456.
- Hochschild, A.R. 1983. The managed heart. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Hoffman, L.W. 1972. Early childhood experiences and women's achievement motives. Journal of Social Issues, 28, 129-155.
- Isenberg, D.J. 1981. Some effects of time pressure on vertical structure and decision making accuracy in small groups. Organizational Behavior and Human Performance, 27, 19, 134.
- Komaki, J., Blood, M.R., & Holder, D. 1980. Fostering friendliness in a fast food franchise. Journal of Organizational Behavior Management, 2, 151-164.
- Looft, W.R. 1973. Socialization and personality throughout the life span: An examination of contemporary psychological approaches. In P.B. Baltes and K.W. Schaie (Eds.), Life-span developmental psychology. New York: Academic Press, 1973.
- Handler, J.M. 1984. Stories, scripts and scenes: Aspects of schema theory. Hillsdale, N.J.: L. Erlbaum Associates.
- McCallum, J.R. & Harrison, W. 1985. Interdependence in the service encounter. In J.A. Czepiel, M.R. Solomon & C.F. Surprenant (Eds.) The Service Encounter (pp. 3-15) Lexington, MA: Lexington Books
- Maccoby, E.E., & Jacklin, C.N. 1974. The psychology of sex differences. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Melbin, M. 1978. Night as frontier. American Sociological Review, 43 (1): 3-22.
- Millett, K. 1970. Sexual Politics, N.Y.: Balentine Books
- Organ, D.W. 1977. A reappraisal and reinterpretation of the satisfaction - causes - performance hypothesis. Academy of Management Review,

2, 46-53.

Peters, T.J. & Austin N. 1985. A passion for excellence. New York:Random House.

Puffer, S.M. 1987. Prosocial behavior, noncompliant behavior, and work performance among commission salespeople. Journal of Applied Psychology, 72,4,615-622.

Putnam, L., & McCallister, L. 1980. Situational effects of task and gender on nonverbal display. In D. Nimmo, (Ed.) Communications Yearbook, 4: 679-697.

Rafaelli, A. 1987. The customer's role in service employee's role set.

Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Academy of Management, New Orleans, LA.

Rafaelli, A., & Sutton, R.I. 1987. The expression of emotion as part of the work role. Academy of Management Review. 12, 1, 23-37.

Salancik, G.R. 1979. Field simulations for organizational behavior research. Administrative Science Quarterly, 24, 638-649.

San Francisco Chronicle 1984. Rules for Santas -- Don't Say "Ho Ho Ho", San Francisco Chronicle, November.

Schneider, B. & Bowen, D. E. 1985. Employees and customer perceptions of service in banks: Replication and extension. Journal of Applied Psychology, 70,423-433.

Schneider, B., Parkington, J.J., & Buxton, V.M. 1980. Employee and customer perceptions of service in banks. Administrative Science Quarterly, 25,252-267.

Siegler, D.M., & Siegler, R.S. 1976. Stereotypes of males' and females' speech. Psychological Reports, 39: 167-170.

Spence, J.T., & Helmreich, R.L. 1978. Masculinity and femininity: Their psychological dimensions, correlates and antecedents. Austin: University of Texas Press.

- Smith, C.A., Organ, D.W., & Near, J.P. 1983. Organizational citizenship behavior: Its nature and antecedents. Journal of Applied Psychology, 68, 4, 653-663.
- Sutton, R.I., & Rafaeli, A. 1987. Untangling the relationship between displayed emotions and organizational sales: The case of convenience stores. Academy of Management Journal. In Press.
- Tidd, K.L., & Lockard, J.S. 1978. Monetary Significance of the Affiliative Smile. Bulletin of the Psychonomic Society, 11: 344-346.
- Van Maanen, J. 1973. Observations on the making of a policeman. Human Organization, 32: 407-417.
- Walt Disney Productions 1982. Your role in the Walt Disney World show. Orlando, FL: Walt Disney Productions.
- Webb, E.S., Campbell, D.T., Schwartz, R.D., Sechrest, L., & Grove, J.B. 1981. Nonreactive measures in the social sciences (2nd ed.) Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company.
- Wicklund, R.A. & Duval, S., 1971. Opinion change and performance facilitation as a result of objective self-awareness. Journal of Experimental Social Psychology, 7, 319-342.
- Wicklund, R.A. & Fry, D. 1980. Self awareness theory: When the self makes a difference. In: The self in social psychology, D.M. Wegner & R.R. Vallacher (eds.), New York: Oxford University Press.
- Wrightman, L.S. 1977. Social psychology. Monterey, CA: Brooks/Cole
- Zedeck, S., Jackson, S.E. & Summers, E. 1983. Shift work schedules and their relationship to health, adaption, satisfaction, and turnover intentions. Academy of Management Journal, 26 (2): 297-310.
- Zuckerman, M., Lipets, M.S., Koivumaki, J.H., & Rosenthal, R. 1975. Encoding and decoding nonverbal areas of emotion. Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 32 (6): 1068-1076.

Table 1
Means, Standard Deviations and Intercorrelations
of Study Variables

n = 1,319

	Mean	SD	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
1. Clerk Emotional Display	.43	.28	-							
2. Emotional Display to Males	.43	.28	.98	-						
3. Emotional Display to Females	.22	.30	.40	.36						
4. Clerk Sex ^a	.55	.50	.12	.13	.08	-				
5. Customer Sex	.20	.40	.12	NR	NR	.02	-			
6. Wearing the Organizational Uniform	1.46	.75	.12	.13	.04	.11	.09	-		
7. Timing of Interaction	1.72	.67	-.03	-.04	-.08	-.06	-.20	-.03	-	
8. Line Length	2.81	1.61	-.16	-.16	.15	.04	.03	-.04	-.06	-
9. Presence of Other Employees	.14	.35	.02	.02	.08	.06	.05	-.02	-.01	.24

^a
Note. Statistics about customer sex are based on an n = 11,716

^b
NR indicates a correlation which can not be computed.

Table 2

Analysis of Variance of Factors Related to
Expressions of Positive Emotions
n = 1,319

<u>Effects</u>	<u>F-Value</u>	<u>Mean Square</u>	<u>Adjusted Eta</u>
<u>Clerk Attribute</u>			
Clerk Sex ^a	38.44***	2.94	.12
<u>Clerk Behavior</u>			
Wearing the Organizational Uniform	14.96***	1.12	.13
Clerk Sex - Uniform interaction ^{a,b}	2.45**	.18	.18
<u>Customer Attributes</u>			
Customer Sex	988.87***	53.67	.19
Clerk Sex - Customer Sex interaction	3.34*	.18	.13
<u>Contextual Attributes</u>			
Line Length	26.54***	2.01	.13
Presence of Other Employees ^c	7.48**	.57	.02
Shift: Timing of an Interaction	.60	.05	.00

- * p < .10
 ** p < .01
 *** p < .001

- Note.
- a. The clerk sex main effect was repeated in these analyses and was found significant.
 - b. Sex of customer was a repeated factor in these analyses since clerks frequently served more than one male or female customer. Each clerk was assigned a score on two dependent variables: emotion displayed to male customers and emotion displayed to female customers. These variables were two values of a repeated factor.
 - c. Since only 25% of the clerks were observed during the night shift the sample size for this analysis is only n=577.

Table 3

Mean Emotional Display Under Various Conditions

n = 1,319

<u>Clerk Behavior</u>	<u>Total</u>	<u>Male Clerks</u> <u>n=596</u>	<u>Female Clerks</u> <u>n=723</u>
<u>Wearing the Organizational Uniform</u>			
Neither Smock nor Tag	.37	.34	.40
Either Smock or Tag	.40	.35	.46
Both Smock and Tag	.46	.43	.48
<u>Customer Attributes</u>			
<u>Customer sex</u>			
Emotion Displayed to Male Customers	.43	.39	.47
Emotion Displayed to Female Customers	.22	.19	.25
<u>Contextual Attributes</u>			
<u>Line Length</u>			
0-1 person	.50	.49	.51
2-3 people	.43	.40	.46
4 + people	.38	.28	.44
<u>Presence of Other Employees</u>			
Others present	.43	.39	.46
Others not present	.45	.41	.47
<u>Shift</u>			
Day Shift	.45	.43	.47
Swing Shift	.43	.38	.48
Night Shift	.44	.39	.54
<u>Total</u>	.43	.39	.46